EVALUATION OF THE IMPLEMENTATION OF MAKE-A-MATCH TYPE COOPERATIVE LEARNING MODEL TO IMPROVE LEARNING OUTCOMES OF ISLAMIC RELIGIOUS EDUCATION IN A SENIOR HIGH SCHOOL

Nur Wahyuningsih[1*,]Nurdin Nurdin [2], Gusnarib A. Wahab[3], & Dzakiah Dzakiah[4]

[1,2,3,4] Islamic Education Department, Postgraduate, Universitas Islam Negeri Datokarama Palu

ABSTRACT

This article discusses the evaluation of the implementation of make-a-match type cooperative learning model to improve learning outcomes of Islamic religious education in a senior high school in Central Sulawesi. The research used a qualitative method with data collection techniques such as direct observation, in-depth interviews, and document analysis. The research findings show that Islamic religious education learning by implementing the make-a-match type cooperative learning model at Banawa Senior High School increased students' achievement results. The make-a-match type cooperative learning model are better than conventional learning because the students show anthusiasm in learning process. The make-a-match type cooperative learning model evaluates each presentation of material to maintain retention (memory), increasing motivational effects and new knowledge, and also increasing memory by adding creations that connect students' new ability to previous knowledge.

ARTICLE INFORMATION

1. Introduction

Islamic religious education is an effort to guide and educate students so that after being educated, the child can fully understand the contents of Islam, practice its meaning and objectives, and finally practice it and make it a religious teaching (Jumahir, Nurdin, & Syahid, 2022). The Islamic religion follows it as a guide to life so that it brings salvation in this world and the afterlife. Islamic religious education can produce people who always strive to perfect their faith, holiness, and morals and play an active role in building civilization and creating harmony in life, especially in advancing a dignified national culture (Mardatillah, Pettalongi, & Nurdin, 2023). Islamic religious education is based on the Qur'an and al-Hadith. This foundation covers all aspects of personality and society. Islamic religious education is given clear guidance in the Al-Qur'an and al-Hadith (Saada & Magadlah, 2021). Thus, the teachings of the Islamic religion further develop the word of Allah SWT. Islamic religious education must equip students with sufficient knowledge and intellectual abilities as

well as practical experience to achieve higher qualifications per learning objectives.

The aim of Islamic religious education in schools, especially at Senior High Schools, is to advance and strengthen the faith by providing and cultivating the knowledge, appreciation, and practice of Islam so that students become developed Muslim people (Jumahir, Nurdin, Pettalongi, Fitri, & Aftori, 2023). Have faith, holiness, nation, and state and can pursue higher levels of education. Both science and technology are rapidly developing, directly and indirectly influenced by the development of education. Therefore, the quality of education, mainly Islamic religious education, must be incredibly high. The use of methods in learning is essential, so Islamic Religious Education teachers need to think about appropriate learning models so that the subject's essence can be understood and relatable for all students. In this way, the desired vital figures are achieved in the learning process (Mardatillah et al., 2023).

The cooperative learning model is one of the most effective learning models used in research, especially in Islamic religious education learning. Cooperative learning appropriately maximizes student learning time (Baker & Clark, 2010). Because Make-a-Match type cooperative learning emphasizes students' discovery with their partners when studying a concept or topic in a comfortable atmosphere, the help of Make-a-Match type cooperative learning can encourage students to do more.

The cooperative learning model can be used in all subjects, especially Islamic Religious Education, and is suitable for students of all ages; students can also learn through playing in a fun atmosphere. Learning in a pleasant atmosphere can increase the active role and motivate students to learn, encouraging them to be enthusiastic about learning in class.

In this case, researchers want to conduct research on the application of the make-a-match type cooperative learning model in Islamic religious education subjects at Banawa 1 Senior High School because cooperative learning is designed to increase student understanding. Knowledge is packaged engagingly so students can progress along the way. In the cooperative learning model, all students actively work with their question-and-answer partners in pairs.

2. Literature Review

2.1 Understanding learning assessment

Evaluation is a systematic assessment of the utility or usefulness of an item (Tian, Atkinson, Portnoy, & Gold, 2007). An evaluation is carried out to determine the value of a program that is educational enough and contains many subjective elements. Evaluation requires information about measurement and evaluation results, which have many dimensions: skills, creativity, attitudes, interests, etc. Evaluation is an activity carried out as an alternative to improve a program or activity that is being or has been implemented.

Evaluation is also understood as a process of planning, collecting, and providing information needed to make

alternative decisions (Newcomer, Hatry, & Wholey, 2015). According to this understanding, every evaluation activity is a process consciously designed to obtain information or data based on that information and then try to make a decision.

A broader definition of evaluation is the process of planning, collecting, and providing the information needed to make various alternative decisions. On the other hand, learning evaluation is the ongoing process of collecting and interpreting data to evaluate decisions made in the design of a learning system (Benko, 2012). According to this understanding, every evaluation activity has three effects:

a. Assessment is an ongoing process that begins at the end of learning and before learning is completed.
b. The evaluation process must be goal-oriented. This means that we need to generate different responses to reinforce learning.
c. Assessments must use various accurate and meaningful measuring tools to collect the information needed for decision making.

Therefore, assessment is the process of gathering information to help teachers identify progress in learning and make better decisions about future education. Assessment is also a systematic process in which decisions are made or determined about the extent to which students have achieved various learning objectives.

2.2 Cooperative learning

One form of learning that follows the constructivist approach philosophy is cooperative learning. Cooperative learning encourages students to be active and actively interact in groups (Slavin, 1980). This lets you combine and test your ideas in a stress-free environment. This method is suitable for motivating students to teach material to their friends.

Cooperative learning comes from the word collaborative(McInnerney & Roberts, 2009). Collaboration means working together as a group or team to help each other. Cooperative learning is a learning model where students learn and work together in small groups of 4-5 people with a heterogeneous group structure. Heterogeneity here refers to the structure of groups that differ in academic ability, gender, race, and perhaps even ethnicity. This trains students to embrace differences and work collaboratively with friends from different backgrounds (McInnerney & Roberts, 2009).

Meanwhile, according to Aris Shoimin, what is meant by cooperative learning is learning where students learn in small groups with varying abilities. When doing group assignments, each member works together and helps understand the learning material. Learning doesn't stop when one of the friends in the group doesn't know the subject.

Cooperative learning, on the other hand, is a form of learning in which students learn and work together in small groups of four to six people with a heterogeneous group structure. There is more interaction with cooperative learning—teachers with students, students with students, and interaction with everyone.

According to Agus Suprijono, cooperative learning is a broader concept that includes all group work, including forms that are led or directed by the teacher. In this case, the teacher sets tasks and questions and provides the given material and information.

Meanwhile, according to Etin Sovisii and Raharjo, cooperative learning means an attitude or behavior in working together or helping, for example, in groups consisting of two or more people, where the participation of each group member dramatically influences the work's success.

Cooperative learning emphasizes teamwork between students who help each other solve a problem in a task set by the teacher. This means studying together in study groups to achieve joint learning goals (Nurdin, Pettalongi, Ahsan, & Febrianti, 2023). This learning method can improve students' abilities in solving various problems they face during learning because students can help each other to overcome the difficulties they face; besides that, there is high solidarity because it is a responsibility of the group.

2.3 Cooperative Learning Objectives

Cooperative learning is a group teaching strategy in which students work together to achieve a common goal. Cooperative learning is conducted in a way that aims to increase student engagement, support participants with leadership and group decision-making experience, and provide students with opportunities to interact with and learn from students from diverse backgrounds as participants or teachers. By working together to achieve common goals, students develop interpersonal skills that can be invaluable in their lives outside school.

The importance of group goals and individual responsibility Encourages students to help each other and encourage each other to do their best. If students do well as a group, the group can only be successful by ensuring that all members learn the material and group members are motivated to teach each other.

Cooperative learning can be an effective learning method, but it can cause a "free" effect if it is not structured well. The freewheeling effect is when some group members perform all or part of the learning task while others remain active and passive. This means that a few group members will only carry out learning activities. This can reduce maximum cooperative learning results. However, this can be minimized if the teacher can convince students that people in the group have individual responsibility for learning.

From the explanation above, the goal of cooperative learning is learning that emphasizes collective appreciation, individual responsibility, and equal opportunities for success. Cooperative learning also directs students to positive interdependence and personal interaction with their group friends, making the learning atmosphere in the classroom effective and enjoyable.

3. Methodology

This study used qualitative multy case study method. A qualitative research method is a naturalistic research method that is conducted in natural settings (Nurdin, Scheepers, &

Stockdale, 2022; Yin, 2011). Qualitative methods will produce descriptive data, then analyze and interpret it with a thematic approach (Nurdin & Pettalongi, 2022). The cases study of this research was a Senior High School in Banawa District, Central Sulawesi. The case study was chosen because the school has implemented cooperative learning for a period of time and the school is also the best state high scholl in the regency.

Data was gathered through direct observation, in-depth interviews, and written document analysis. In-depth interviews involve ten teachers and five students. We also interviewed two administrative staffs within the school to get more insight from ther perspectives. Meanwhile, written document analysis includes the content of the curriculum within the school to understand the learning model. Data analysis in this study was carried out by thematic data analysis as suggested by Corbin and Strauss (1990). The thematic analysis referred to in this study is by finding themes in data from observations, in-depth interviews, and written document analysis. The data analysis process was completed if no new themes were found in the data (Rusli, Hasyim, & Nurdin, 2021; Rusli & Nurdin, 2021). Data verification was carried out by comparing data from three sources: observation, in-depth interviews, and written document analysis.

4. Result and Discussion

4.1 Application of the Make-a-Match Type Cooperative Learning Model

Applying make-a-match learning in Islamic religious education is one of the methods used to achieve the stated goals. Learning models are necessary for teachers in teaching and learning activities (Irawan, Nurdin, & Hamka, 2023). One learning model that can be applied in the learning process is the make-a-match model, which, in this case, can be implemented in Islamic religious education learning.

It is time for the Islamic Religious Education learning pattern to be changed. It initially only used the lecture method, so learning became monotonous, and students needed help understanding the learning content. Teachers who spearhead the success of learning must realize that they are responsible for the success of Islamic religious education learning, in this case, success at the cognitive or knowledge level. This is where teacher creativity is needed in delivering Islamic Religious Education learning. One of the learning models that can be used in Islamic religious education is the make-a-match model (looking for a partner).

The make-a-match learning model is a learning model that can improve learning outcomes because the process is enjoyable, and students are involved in the learning process. With an exciting method, students can better understand and remember the material taught, mainly Islamic religious education.

Based on the results of the researcher's observations while at the research location and interacting with school residents, it is known that the implementation of Islamic religious education learning has gone well at the

school. This follows the researcher's observations and is also based on the explanation from the school principal regarding the implementation of Islamic religious education learning. From the results of the researcher's interview with Mr. Malik, the principal of Banawa 1 Senior High School:

> "The implementation of learning in general, mainly Islamic religious education, had gone well. This is in accordance with the results of my monitoring as the school principal and from the evaluations submitted by teachers at the end of each semester and during meetings regarding improving the quality of student education. As a school principal, I always tell all teachers to be creative and innovative in delivering student learning.

From the results of the presentation given by the principal, a teacher, especially an Islamic religious education teacher, must be able to bring something new to the learning process, both in terms of delivering material, methods, or learning models that are more active for students or directly involved in the learning process. Learning Islamic religious education is one of the lessons that is very important for Muslims to know, especially for students at Banawa 1 Senior High School. Because in it, we are taught how to understand the Islamic religion in a kaffah (comprehensive) manner, whether it concerns issues of worship, ethics/morals, history, and so on. By understanding Islam well, we will not fall into things that are prohibited in Islam or that are not following the norms taught in Islam.

The researcher's findings from the results of observations are that Islamic religious learning has gone well and has used several methods in delivering it, such as lectures, discussions, and others. However, in this case, the researcher wants to discuss more deeply about applying Islamic religious learning using the make-a-match type cooperative learning model. The make-a-match type learning model is a cooperative learning model where the learning process requires the direct involvement of the students (Taylor, 1994). The results of interviews with Islamic Religious Education teachers are as follows:

> "We have implemented this make-a-match type learning model in all classes when learning Islamic Religious Education, and the students feel happy because learning using the make-a-match model requires cooperation in finding solutions to problems in a group and individual responsibility. Each group member must carry out their duties so that the next task in the group can be carried out.

The results of interviews with Islamic Religious Education teachers show that the way the material is delivered uses many methods to encourage students to be active in the learning process.

4.2 Learning Islamic Religious Education using a make-a-match type cooperative learning model.

Banawa Senior High School is an educational institution that requires dynamics to maintain its existence, especially in improving the quality of learning; in this case, several learning models are carried out at this institution, especially in Islamic religious education subjects. In learning activities, Islamic religious education is one of the many subjects at this institution that applies the make-a-match type cooperative learning model. This is following what was conveyed by Mr. Malik as the school principal as follows:

> "The subject of Islamic Religious Education is one of several existing subjects that have implemented various existing learning models, including the make-a-match type cooperative learning model, according to what the Islamic Religious Education teacher told me. "With this learning model implemented by teachers at this institution, the aim is to improve the quality of academic and non-academic subjects, in this case Islamic Religious Education."

In planning learning using the make-a-match type cooperative model, everything is described quite clearly in the learning tool documents, both the Learning Implementation Plan and the semester program and annual program, and the contents of the Learning Implementation Plan also clearly explain each method, material, and media. Along with others per basic competency.

Likewise, students' preparations when starting the learning process have also been arranged so that the plans outlined in the Learning Implementation Plan can achieve their objectives. This is as stated by the Islamic Religious Education teacher, as follows:

> "Everything must be clear in planning because in the Learning Implementation Plan, that is our guideline when teaching, and we as teachers continue to adjust to good conditions later when we deliver it in class."

Indeed, planning is less smooth than when we started the process, but as an educator, we must try to do our best to achieve the learning process, especially by using the make-a-match learning model. The Islamic Religious Education learning process uses the teacher's make-a-match type cooperative learning model. We use several media from pieces of paper filled with questions, answers, and numbers that we provide for students. Still, some children want to refrain from participating in this activity during the process. This is following what was conveyed by the teacher teaching Islamic religious education subjects who explained to us as follows:

> "For learning plan, we often discuss with other teachers, and we often exchange opinions in planning existing material, but in preparing a learning plan, several important points must be considered carefully, namely related to determining learning, learning models, and looking at conditions. We have arranged the results of the learning plan from

existing schools, which we usually write in the Learning Implementation Plan to suit each material that will be presented later."

From the research results and interviews of researchers with informants regarding the Islamic Religious Education learning plan, the teacher prepares a Learning Implementation Plan in the learning process so that the learning process can run well. In implementing the things that have been planned, sometimes they encounter problems or obstacles, and this is normal in every type of learning. Researchers also learned from informants that several things must be considered, including determining learning objectives because objectives are the most important thing in any existing learning process, choosing learning models, and looking at existing school conditions, including classroom conditions and teaching materials/ learning resources available at school.

4.3 Implementation of Islamic Religious Education learning using a make-a-match type cooperative learning model

The process of learning Islamic Religious Education using the make-a-match type cooperative learning model requires quite a long time because the learning process of Islamic Religious Education utilizing this method will not be able to take place quickly but will require quite a long time.

Apart from requiring long learning time or hours, this learning model also requires appropriate learning

conditions, starting from students, the environment, and educators. This means that everyone in the learning process must participate. In this case, it also appears to be the same as what was conveyed by Mrs. Norma as Head of Curriculum at this institution. She said the following:

> "In our school, we use various methods in the learning process, from ordinary to extraordinary. What I mean by extraordinary is the new method or model, which usually uses foreign terms, while the ordinary one is most like lectures, questions, answers, and assignments in every lesson. In the learning process using the learning model presented by the educators, the class is usually the rowdyest of the several classes, meaning that the rowdy is not noisy playing without clarity. Instead, all the students are very enthusiastic about this."

In the process of learning Islamic religious education subjects at Banawa 1 Senior High School, it looks as usual, but when researchers make thorough observations in the learning process, especially when using the make-a-match type cooperative model, researchers see that there are several quite significant influences in improving the quality of learning. Among them, the researcher saw the readiness of the educator when starting the process, and he appeared to be alert and always punctual in accommodating the course of learning. From the start, when the educator distributed several questions and answers, it was seen that the educator

was skilled enough to take the learning process according to plan. There were problems in some, but they were all resolved well.

The same thing was also conveyed by several students who were interviewed directly by researchers, including as explained by Azrin Khalid, a class XI science student as follows:

> "Yes, ma'am, when we were taught, we felt awkward for the first time with a learning model like that. Then it turned out well after we did it. We felt happy and lost our sleepiness. When teaching with a make-a-match model, we first felt that this lesson became easy to understand because you are asked to stand up when the learning process starts."

In delivering material to students, educators use various methods based on what researchers found when conducting observations. In implementing the make-a-match type cooperative learning model, researchers see that educators do not always play a role as facilitators in Islamic Religious Education learning. Still, educators also often act as motivators when learning takes place.

The learning process must adapt to the circumstances and class conditions, and students must support the learning process. Mrs. Megatrisna conveyed this as the teacher of Islamic religious education subjects, and she explained as follows:

> "In learning, you have to adapt to all existing conditions, especially when learning hours are often a problem if the time for Islamic Religious Education is in the afternoon; usually, many people are tired and sleepy, especially if the time for Islamic Religious Education is after sports time and if you are teaching lectures continuously. Many of the materials we convey to students don't come in. If we face something like that, we condition the learning with learning models that activate students, such as the make-a-match type learning model, which is very helpful in learning."

In implementing the cooperative learning model, some training is needed to be able to use the learning model effectively and efficiently. Researchers found that teachers at this institution often received several invitations to training or workshops to support the learning process. Not only that, in Islamic Religious Education Teacher Deliberation activities, which are held at least once a month, opinions and insights are also often exchanged with fellow Islamic Religious Education Teachers in various schools, which also discuss improving the quality of learning.

This was also confirmed by Mr. Norma, Deputy Head of Curriculum, who said the following:

> "To improve the quality of learning for teachers, especially for Islamic Religious Education Teachers, training organized by the Ministry of Religion and the National Education Department is often carried out. There are many of them, and in the Subject Teacher Deliberation, we also

often discuss this matter, especially since we use the K-13 curriculum, which requires this training. Apart from always updating the learning process, it also serves as a forum for discussing problems in learning, which has received a positive response from everyone."

Overall, the learning process implemented by educators at this institution, especially in Islamic religious education, is entirely satisfactory, with several conditions obtained by researchers in interviews, observations, and documentation. In the last few years, student achievement has increased significantly, and the response from The number of students also increased, as indicated by the enjoyable learning process.

4.4 Results of Implementing the Make-a-Match Type Cooperative Learning Model

In the learning process of Islamic Religious Education at Banawa Senior High School, researchers saw that several problems often emerged when the learning process began. Starting from this, researchers saw the importance of evaluation in every activity, and several Islamic Religious Education educators at the institution often held several discussions regarding what had been taught to students in terms of assessing the implementation of the make-a-match type cooperative learning model for educators to evaluate fellow Islamic Religious Education teachers. Starting from goal achievement, learning completion, student attitudes, and behavior after learning using the make-a-match type cooperative learning model. In terms of Mr. Wandi's evaluation, in several interviews with researchers, he said that:

> "In evaluating learning, we all condition it, even though it's not formal and sometimes just like normal chat; my other Islamic Religious Education Teacher friends and I often ask questions and provide input regarding learning from the students. I see the level of success in implementing the model make-a-match type cooperative learning is still far from perfect because there are still some children who remain passive in learning; for example, when I tell them to come forward, there are those who are brave, and there are also those who are shy."

To see to what extent the implementation of the make-a-match type cooperative learning model affects students, it is necessary to conduct several fairly detailed evaluations, starting with the students by giving several questions or assignments after delivering learning using the make-a-match type cooperative model. Educators assess how many children can answer the material and how many children cannot. In the Islamic religious education learning process, using the make-a-match type cooperative learning model is very effective and successful in improving the quality of Islamic religious education learning. This is also following what was conveyed by Mrs. Megatrisna as follows:

"With the make-a-match type cooperative learning model, especially in Islamic religious education learning, it can improve student achievement to be better, even if it is not completely successful, at least it can achieve more than the Minimum Completeness Criteria score and also increase students' interest in learning. Students are thrilled with this learning, especially when divided into several groups, all competing to get the highest score, and other results for non-academic fields also show excellent things."

Meanwhile, in observing documents carried out by researchers at this institution, researchers also saw several daily test results from students and assignments given to them by educators. Researchers notice that students' grades in Islamic religious education have increased in the academic field. This is also balanced by various achievements in the educational field with outside activities such as extracurricular activities held at the institution, including scouting, singing, prayer, football, and martial arts. This was also conveyed by Mrs. Megatrisna as follows:

"In terms of academic achievement, there has been an increase, from report cards and grades obtained during daily tests and semester tests, even when providing evaluations by asking students questions directly. This shows a good improvement; although some children remain the same and do not experience changes, that number is decreasing. Furthermore, in the non-academic field, there are several activities, including scouting, singing, prayer, football, martial arts, and Islamic dancing."

These are the results obtained by the researcher from several interviews with informants, as well as the effects of observations and documentation obtained by the researcher. Several learning outcomes by applying the make-a-match type cooperative learning model significantly impact students' grades/achievements, which show higher than the Minimum Completeness Criteria scores. These results also have an impact on students' attitudes and behavior, which reflect commendable behavior such as being polite to teachers, being happy in the Islamic Religious Education learning process, and being active in group learning, as well as increasing attitudes of acceptance between a learning group and improving students' learning motivation.

4.5 First Research Findings

Findings related to the first focus are Islamic Religious Education learning plan using the make-a-match type cooperative learning model. Regarding the researcher's observations from interviews, observations, and documentation of learning plans using the make-a-match type cooperative learning model, the researcher found that in planning Islamic religious education, educators coordinated or discussed with fellow Islamic Religious

Education teachers at the school the material being taught. Later, it will be introduced, which has previously been discussed by the principal and deputy head of curriculum, then look at the existing material and adjust the learning model that will be implemented, determine the source of learning materials, and determine the media that is following the make-a-match type cooperative learning model by choosing learning objectives, selecting appropriate learning models, and looking at existing school conditions by considering the availability of learning resources/materials that have been previously discussed by the representative for curriculum.

Findings related to the second focus are implementing learning using the make-a-match type cooperative learning model. Implementation of the learning process using the make-a-match type cooperative learning model, as far as the researchers got in the Islamic religious education learning process, the teacher formed groups then distributed several question cards in which there were questions and answers to be given to the students who then looked for their respective partners. Learning is also usually done outside the classroom, such as in mosques and libraries.

Findings related to the third focus are the learning outcomes using the make-a-match type cooperative learning model. Regarding implementing Islamic Religious Education learning using the make-a-match type cooperative learning model, the learning results effectively improve the quality of learning. These results can be seen from the students'

direct responses when they receive the learning process with pleasure and the interaction between students and others. Other things are increasing: students' activeness in learning is increasing, whether they are active in asking questions, responding to each answer, or conveying their answers; in the assessment of semester tests and others, it is seen that there has been an increase in Islamic religious education subjects.

5. Conclusion

The research findings show that Islamic religious education learning by implementing the make-a-match type cooperative learning model at Banawa Senior High School increased students' achievement results. The make-a-match type cooperative learning model are better than conventional learning because the students show anthusiasm in learning process. The make-a-match type cooperative learning model evaluates each presentation of material to maintain retention (memory), increasing motivational effects and new knowledge, and also increasing memory by adding creations that connect students' new ability to previous knowledge.

REFERENCES

Baker, Trish, & Clark, Jill. (2010). Cooperative learning – a double-edged sword: a cooperative learning model for use with diverse student groups. *Intercultural Education, 21*(3), 257-

268. doi:10.1080/14675981003760440

Benko, Susanna L. (2012). Scaffolding: An Ongoing Process to Support Adolescent Writing Development. *Journal of Adolescent & Adult Literacy, 56*(4), 291-300. doi:https://doi.org/10.1002/JAAL.00142

Corbin, Juliet M., & Strauss, Anselm. (1990). Grounded theory research: Procedures, canons, and evaluative criteria. *Qualitative Sociology, 13*(1), 3-21. doi:10.1007/bf00988593

Irawan, Aan, Nurdin, Nurdin, & Hamka, Hamka. (2023). *Religious Moderation Village as a Model For Strengthening Social Cohesion in Nunu Village, Tatanga District, Palu City.* Paper presented at the International Conference on Islamic and Interdisciplinary Studies (ICIIS), Palu.

Jumahir, Jumahir, Nurdin, Nurdin, Pettalongi, Adawiyah, Fitri, Anindya, & Aftori, Rohmatika. (2023). Religious Culture Implementation in State Islamic Senior High School in Indonesia. *Research and Analysis Journal, 6*(2), 19-26.

Jumahir, Jumahir, Nurdin, Nurdin, & Syahid, Ahmad. (2022). *The Role Of The Principal In The Development Of Religious Culture In Man 1 Banggai.* Paper presented at the Proceeding of International Conference on Islamic and Interdisciplinary Studies, Palu.

Mardatillah, Mardatillah, Pettalongi, Sagaf S, & Nurdin, Nurdin. (2023). *Islamic Religious Education Learning Model In Instruding The Values Of Religious Moderation At Bina Potential Vocational School, Palu.* Paper presented at the International Conference on Islamic and Interdisciplinary Studies ICIIS), Palu.

McInnerney, Joanne M., & Roberts, Tim S. (2009). Collaborative and Cooperative Learning. In Patricia L. Rogers, Gary A. Berg, Judith V. Boettcher, Caroline Howard, Lorraine Justice, & Karen D. Schenk (Eds.), *Encyclopedia of Distance Learning, Second Edition* (pp. 319-326). Hershey, PA, USA: IGI Global.

Newcomer, Kathryn E., Hatry, Harry P., & Wholey, Joseph S. (2015). Planning and Designing Useful Evaluations *Handbook of Practical Program Evaluation* (pp. 7-35).

Nurdin, Nurdin, Pettalongi, Sagaf S, Ahsan, Muhammad Nur, & Febrianti, Vindy. (2023). Factors affecting students' continuance intention to use teaching performance assessment application from technology continuance theory. *International Journal of Electrical and Computer Engineering (IJECE), 13*(5), 5342-5353.

Nurdin, Nurdin, & Pettalongi, Sagaf Sulaiman. (2022). Interpretive case study to understand online communication in an e-tendering project implementation. *Jurnal Manajemen Komunikasi, 7*(1), 35-54.

Nurdin, Nurdin, Scheepers, Helana, & Stockdale, Rosemary. (2022). A social system for sustainable local e-government. *Journal of Systems*

and Information Technology, 24(1), 1-31. doi:10.1108/JSIT-10-2019-0214

Rusli, Rusli, Hasyim, Muhammad Syarif, & Nurdin, Nurdin. (2021). A New Islamic Knowledge Production And Fatwa Rulings: How Indonesia's Young Muslim Scholars Interact With Online Sources. *Journal of Indonesian Islam, 14*(2), 499-518.

Rusli, Rusli, & Nurdin, Nurdin. (2021). Understanding Indonesia millennia Ulama online knowledge acquisition and use in daily fatwa making habits. *Education and Information Technologies*. doi:10.1007/s10639-021-10779-7

Saada, Najwan, & Magadlah, Haneen. (2021). The meanings and possible implications of critical Islamic religious education. *British Journal of Religious Education, 43*(2), 206-217. doi:10.1080/01416200.2020.1785844

Slavin, Robert E. (1980). Cooperative Learning. *Review of Educational Research, 50*(2), 315-342. doi:10.3102/00346543050002315

Taylor, Edward W. (1994). A learning model for becoming interculturally competent. *International Journal of Intercultural Relations, 18*(3), 389-408. doi:https://doi.org/10.1016/0147-1767(94)90039-6

Tian, Jing, Atkinson, Nancy L., Portnoy, Barry, & Gold, Robert S. (2007). A systematic review of evaluation in formal continuing medical education. *Journal of Continuing Education in the Health Professions, 27*(1), 16-27. doi:https://doi.org/10.1002/chp.89

Yin, Robert K. (2011). *Qualitative Research From Start to Finish*. New York: The Guilford Press.