APPLICATION OF COOPERATIVE LEARNING MODEL WITH JIGSAW TYPE TO IMPROVE LEARNING OUTCOMES OF ISLAMIC RELIGIOUS EDUCATION AND CHARACTER

Ritayanti Ritayanti[1*,] Fatimah Saguni[2], Nurdin Nurdin[3] & Olvianty Olvianty[4]

[1,2,3,4] Islamic Education Department, Postgraduate, Institut Agama Islam Negeri Palu

ABSTRACT

ARTICLE INFORMATION

This study discusses the implementation of the Jigsaw Cooperative Learning Model to Improve Learning Outcomes. This stufy used as qualitative method. Data were gathered through direct observation, in-depth interview, and written document analysis. In-depth interview involving the school principal, religious teachers, and students. This study found that the Jigsaw cooperative learning method is a form of learning in which students learn and work in small groups collaboratively, with members of 4 to 6 people with a heterogeneous group structure. In forming groups composed of two parts, the first group of origin and the expert group of each participant is responsible for mastering the part of the learning material and can teach the material to the group. The learning step of the jigsaw method consists of 6 activity steps, namely, the teacher divides the class into several study groups. Each group consists of 4-6 students. The teacher provides teaching material in text, which has been divided into several sub-materials for study by each group member. All groups study the teaching material that the teacher has given. Expert groups meet and discuss the material topics for which they are responsible. Expert group members return to their home groups to help their groups. The teacher evaluates student learning outcomes individually. Applying the Jigsaw Learning model is very effective; this can be seen from the positive things done by students, namely getting high grades, being disciplined and responsible, and stimulating students' intellectual curiosity.

1. Introduction

One of the special subjects given to students is Islamic religious education. Islamic religious education as one of the subjects in schools has a very strategic and significant role in forming students' morals and personalities. Islamic religious education, in general, can be understood as an effort to increase students' faith, understanding, appreciation, and experience of Islam (Manea, 2014; Rahmadhani, Attamimi, & Hanafi, 2023). So that they become

International Journal of Contemporary Islamic Education
Vol. 6 No. 2 Tahun 2024

Muslim individuals who are faithful and pious, have noble morals, and have good character in their personal, social, national, and state lives.

In general, learning is carried out by teachers using conventional methods, namely lecture methods, and expecting students to sit, be quiet, listen, take notes, and memorize. So, teaching and learning activities are still monotonous and less interesting to students. Such conditions will cause a decrease in student learning motivation and a lack of student understanding of Islamic religious education subjects. Based on research, this problem is not much different from what happened at SMP Negeri 1 Palu. Low student attention to Islamic religious education subjects is caused by the absence of increased student learning motivation during teaching and learning activities.

A professional teacher is required to demonstrate his expertise as a teacher in front of the class (Amiruddin, Nurdin, & Ali, 2021; Dietrich, Dicke, Kracke, & Noack, 2015). The components that must be mastered are using a variety of learning models that can attract students' interest in learning, and teachers are not enough to give lectures in front of the class. This does not mean that the lecture method is not good, but at some point, students will get bored if only the teacher speaks while they sit, stay still, and listen. Boredom in listening to the teacher's explanation can kill students' enthusiasm for learning. Therefore, teachers need to master learning models.

One of the student-oriented learning models is the cooperative learning model (Baker & Clark, 2010; Hsiung, 2012). According to Rusman, this learning model can train students to be active. Cooperative learning involves student participation in a small group to interact with each other.

One of the cooperative learning models is the jigsaw type (Perkins & Saris, 2001). The jigsaw learning model is a type of cooperative learning that encourages students to be active and help each other master lessons to achieve maximum achievement (Aronson, 2002).

2. Literature Review

2.1 Understanding the Cooperative Learning Model

Learning is a change in personality that expresses itself as a new pattern of reactions in the form of skills, attitudes, habits, personality, or an understanding (Säljö, 1979). Learning is a process in which behavior is generated or changed through practice or experience. Learning is a process carried out by individuals to obtain a new change in behavior as a whole as a result of the individual's experience in interacting with their environment (Allen, Donham, & Bernhardt, 2011).

Based on the explanation according to the experts about the definition of learning above, it can be concluded that the definition of learning is a change experienced by a person from initially not knowing to knowing, this is caused by interactions between

individuals or from various literature or sources.

Bahri explained that cooperative learning is a learning model where students learn and work in small groups collaboratively, with members of 4 to 6 people with a heterogeneous group structure. The success of learning from the group depends on the abilities and activities of the group members, both individually and as a group.

Implementing the cooperative learning model requires participation and cooperation in the learning group. Cooperative learning can improve students' learning methods towards better learning and attitudes toward helping each other in some social behaviors (Baker & Clark, 2010). The main objective of implementing the cooperative learning model is for students to learn in groups with their friends by respecting each other's opinions and allowing others to express their ideas by conveying their opinions in groups.

Through cooperative learning, students will be given the opportunity to work together with fellow students in structured tasks (Siegel, 2005). Through cooperative learning, a student will become a source of learning for his/her friends. Lie said, "Cooperative learning is developed based on the assumption that the learning process will be more meaningful if students can teach each other." In cooperative learning, students can learn from two main sources: teachers and other study friends.

Cooperative learning is a form of learning in which students learn and work in small groups collaboratively whose members consist of four to six people with a heterogeneous group structure (Slavin, 1980). The cooperative learning model, namely learning activities in groups to help each other construct concepts and solve problems or inquiries. According to theory and experience, in order for a group to be cohesive (participatory compact), each group member consists of 4-5 people, heterogeneous students (ability, gender, character, there is control and facilitation, and takes responsibility for group results in the form of reports or presentations.

In this learning, there will be interaction and communication between teachers and students, students and students, and students and teachers (multi-way traffic communication). The purpose of forming the group is to allow all students to be actively involved in the thinking process and learning activities. While working in groups, the task of group members is to achieve completeness of the material presented by the teacher and to help each other in their group to achieve learning completeness.

During cooperative learning, students are taught specific skills so that they can work well together in their groups, such as being an active listener, providing explanations to group members, discussing, and so on.

Learning using cooperatives and developing students' self-quality, especially the affective aspect, can be done together. In small group learning with cooperative principles, achieving learning goals, both cognitive, affective,

and psychomotor functions, is good. The learning atmosphere in mutual trust, openness, and relaxed interactions between group members provides opportunities for students to obtain and provide input to develop knowledge, attitudes, values, morals, and skills they want to develop in learning.

Cooperative learning includes a small group that works as a team to solve a problem, complete a task, or do something to achieve other common goals. In implementing jigsaw-type cooperative learning there are several steps that must be taken, namely as follows:

a. Formation of Original Groups

Each original group consists of 4-6 members with heterogeneous abilities.

b. Learning in Original Groups

Each member of the original group studies the sub-subject matter that will become their expertise, then each works on the task individually.

c. Formation of Expert Groups

The leader of the original group divides the tasks to each member to become an expert in one sub-subject matter. Then each expert in the same sub-subject matter from different groups joins to form a new group called an expert group.

d. Expert Group Discussion

Expert group members teach assignments and discuss with each other about the problems that are their responsibility. Each expert group member learns the subject matter until they feel confident in conveying and solving problems related to the sub-subject matter that is their responsibility.

e. Home Group Discussion (Parent)

Expert group members return to their respective home groups. Then, each home group member explains and answers questions about the sub-subject matter that is their expertise to the other members of the home group. This takes place in turns until all members of the home group have had a turn.

f. Class Discussion

Guided by the teacher, the class discussion discusses important concepts that are the subject of debate in the expert group discussion. The teacher tries to correct the misconceptions of the students.

g. Giving Quizzes

Quizzes are done individually. The scores obtained by each member of the original group are added up to obtain the total group score.

h. Giving Group Awards

The group that obtains the highest score is given an award in the form of a certificate and bonus score.

2.2 Learning Outcomes

Learning outcomes are the abilities possessed by students after receiving their learning experiences. Student learning outcomes are essentially changes that include cognitive, affective, and psychomotor fields oriented to the teaching and learning process experienced by students.

Learning outcomes are a process that is marked by changes in a person (Hussey & Smith, 2003). Changes as a result of the learning process are shown in various forms, such as changes in attitudes and behavior and changes in

other aspects of the individual who is learning.

Learning outcomes are important things that will be used as a benchmark for the success of the learning system provided by the teacher, whether it is successful or not. A teaching and learning process is said to be successful if the desired basic competencies are achieved. To find out whether or not these competencies are achieved, the teacher conducts a test after presenting learning materials to students. From the results of this test, the extent to which the students are successful in learning is known.

As stated by UNESCO, four pillars of learning outcomes are expected to be achieved by education: learning to know, learning to be, learning to live together, and learning to do. Bloom (1956) calls it three learning outcomes domains: cognitive, affective and psychomotor. The national education system and the formulation of educational objectives, both curricular objectives and instructional objectives, generally use Bloom's classification of learning outcomes, which broadly divides them into three domains, namely cognitive, affective, and psychomotor domains. The cognitive domain relates to intellectual learning outcomes and consists of six aspects: knowledge, understanding, application, analysis, synthesis, and evaluation. The first two aspects are called low-level cognitive, and the following four aspects are included in high-level cognitive.

The affective domain relates to attitudes and consists of five aspects: acceptance, response or reaction,

assessment, organization, and internalization (Casey & Fernandez-Rio, 2019). The psychomotor domain relates to learning outcomes of skills and the ability to act, consisting of six aspects: reflex movements, basic movement skills, perceptual abilities, harmony or consistency, complex skill movements, and expressive and interpretive movements.

The benefits of tolerance between religious communities include: First, increasing faith and piety, because the existence of other religions encourages every adherent of a religion to further explore and practice the teachings of their religion. Second, maintaining national stability because tolerance can avoid tensions arising from differences in beliefs. Third, supporting development because harmony between religious communities allows society to unite in supporting development and fourth, strengthening brotherhood, by maintaining a sense of togetherness and reducing personal and group interests.

1. Tolerance in Schools

Tolerance of religion does not mean being free to follow the worship and rituals of all religions. However, religious tolerance must be understood as a form of recognition of the existence of other religions besides one's religion, with all forms of systems and procedures for worship and providing freedom to practice each person's religious beliefs. The concept of tolerance in Islam is rational, practical, and easy to understand. However, in relation to belief (aqidah) and worship, Muslims do not know the word compromise.

Muslims' belief in Allah is not the same as the belief of adherents of other religions in their Gods. Likewise, with the procedures for worship.

Islam even forbids its followers from criticizing the Gods of any religion. Tolerance is respecting others who have differences with oneself, even towards those who sometimes seem to oppose or be hostile (Aderibigbe et al., 2023; Muhtifah, Prasojo, Sappe3, & Elmansyah, 2021). This opinion states that prejudice against individuals who are different must be avoided. Even though there is an impression that other individuals show hostility, they must still respect and honor them. Furthermore, Muchlas Samani and Hariyanto stated that tolerance is an attitude of openly accepting others whose maturity levels and backgrounds differ. The opinion states that a person should not discriminate in the treatment of others who have different levels of maturity and backgrounds than him. A person must continue to accept and respect others with different backgrounds.

To obtain learning outcomes, an evaluation or assessment is carried out, which is a follow-up or way to measure the level of student mastery. The progress of student learning achievement is not only measured from the level of mastery of knowledge but also attitudes and skills. Thus, assessing student learning outcomes covers everything in school, whether it concerns knowledge, attitudes, or skills.

2.3 Islamic Religious Education and Character Education

Before defining Islamic religious education, it is necessary to explain its meaning. Frederick J. Mc. Donald stated, "Education is a process or an activity which is directed at producing desirable changes in the behavior of human beings". From this definition, it is understood that education is a process or an activity that aims to produce desired changes in human behavior.

The process of nurturing, guidance, and processing includes physical and spiritual. As stated by Ngalim Purwanto in Muslam, education is guidance that is deliberately given by adults to children in physical and spiritual growth so that it is helpful for themselves and for society.

The direction of this education is to attempt to achieve positive goals. As emphasized by M Fadhli al-Jamaly in Jalaluddin, namely education is an effort to develop, encourage, and invite humans to be more advanced based on high values and a noble life so that a perfect person is formed, both in relation to reason, feelings, and actions.

2.4 Basics of Implementing Islamic Religious Education and Character Education

In the 2013 Curriculum document, Islamic Religious Education has the additional phrase "Budi Pekerti" so that it becomes Islamic religious education and moral education so that it can be interpreted as education that provides knowledge and forms students' attitudes, personalities, and skills in practicing Islamic teachings, which are carried out at least through subjects at all levels of education.

Religious Education is education that is understood and developed from the fundamental teachings and values contained in the Qur'an and Sunnah (Arif, Nurdin, & Elya, 2023; White *, 2004). Thus, Islamic Religious Education is a conscious effort to foster and educate students so that they can always understand Islamic teachings as a whole (kaffah), then live the goals that can ultimately practice and make Islam a way of life. Islamic Religious Education in Schools is expected to be able to form personal piety (individual) and social piety so that religious education is expected not to foster fanaticism, foster intolerance among students and the Indonesian people and, weaken the harmony of religious life and weaken national unity.

3. Methodology

This study used a qualitative multi-case study method. A qualitative research method is a naturalistic research method that is conducted in natural settings (Nurdin, Scheepers, & Stockdale, 2022; Yin, 2011). Qualitative methods will produce descriptive data, then analyze and interpret it with a thematic approach (Nurdin & Pettalongi, 2022). The case study of this research was a State Junior High School in Palu City, Central Sulawesi province in Indonesia.

Data was gathered through direct observation, in-depth interviews, and written document analysis. In-depth interviews involved the principal, the vice principal for curriculum affairs, an Islamic Religious Education teacher, and students from Junior High School 1 Palu.

Meanwhile, written document analysis included the content of the learning process at the school to understand the program of implementing the jigsaw cooperative learning model to improve learning outcomes in Islamic Religious Education and character education. Data analysis in this study was carried out by thematic data analysis as suggested by Corbin and Strauss (Corbin & Strauss, 1990). The thematic analysis referred to in this study is by finding themes in data from observations, in-depth interviews, and written document analysis. The data analysis process was completed if no new themes were found in the data (Rusli, Hasyim, & Nurdin, 2021; Rusli & Nurdin, 2021). Data verification was carried out by comparing data from three sources: observation, in-depth interviews, and written document analysis.

4. Result and Discussion

4.1 Implementation of Jigsaw Type Cooperative Learning Model

Jigsaw-type cooperative learning is applied in State Junior High School 1 Palu, especially in the field of Islamic Religious Education. According to teachers at State Junior High School 1 Palu, this learning needs to be applied because it has a positive impact on students in learning and through cooperative learning a student will become a source of learning for their friends through the process of cooperation and helping each other so that a productive learning process and results are achieved.

Based on the results of the two interviews and observations above, the researcher knows that the jigsaw learning model is a learning model that emphasizes active cooperation so that it can build a deep mindset where students teach each other. In implementing the jigsaw learning method itself, the teacher did not experience any difficulties or obstacles.

Based on the results of observations made by the researcher, the obstacles experienced by teachers or students in implementing the jigsaw-type learning method in the subjects of Islamic Religious Education and Character Education did not experience obstacles, as explained by informant Emi Indra as a teacher of Islamic Religious Education and Character Education, said that:

> There are no obstacles; it's just that basic Al-Quran competencies usually constrain us because many students have not been able to read the Al-Quran since Elementary School. That's the only obstacle; there are none.

From the results of interviews with researchers and students of State Junior High School 1 Palu, it was explained that in the learning process, students were very enthusiastic in discussing, felt happy, not pressured by the burden of assignments, and enjoyable. Students also easily understood the sub-materials taught. The principal of State Junior High School 1 Palu said that:

> The importance of the jigsaw learning model in improving critical thinking in students to foster a social spirit of mutual cooperation so that it can

give rise to the courage to appear in front of their friends can open insights in thinking in solving problems.

The implementation of the jigsaw learning model and teachers of Islamic religious education and character education subjects, especially in the competence of Facing the Future with Optimism, Endeavor and Trust in class IX A at State Junior High School 1 Palu is a learning model used by teachers where students' activeness in learning can improve critical thinking, courage in expressing ideas and the most important thing is cooperation in groups and foster a sense of responsibility for both individuals and groups in successfully achieving learning goals.

4.2 Results of the Application of the Jigsaw-Type Cooperative Learning Model on Student Learning Outcomes

Based on the results of observations made by the researcher, it is known that before the jigsaw learning model was implemented, the learning outcomes of students at State Middle School 1 Palu were less than satisfactory, and many did not complete due to the lack of creativity and skills of students in receiving lessons given by Islamic religious education and character education teachers. As explained by the informant that:

> The learning outcomes of students before the implementation of the jigsaw cooperative learning method were less than satisfactory because only a few people completed the lessons, but this did not dampen my enthusiasm as a teacher of Islamic

religious education and character education, where I looked for gaps where the weaknesses of students were in the methods I applied.

Another teacher of Islamic religious education and character education that also said as follows:

> Students' learning scores that are not complete because students are not proactive in capturing the learning given. Students still feel confused in solving problems or assignments given.

Based on the results of observations and interviews conducted by the researcher, it is known that the learning outcomes of students before the jigsaw-type model was implemented on student learning outcomes did not go well and did not meet the expectations of teachers and students, but not all students completed their scores, so for those who did not complete, remedial was given until they completed.

The interviews and observations on the assessment above also show that before implementing the Jigsaw type model, student learning outcomes were still incomplete because students were less proactive in capturing the learning provided. Students still feel confused in solving problems or assignments given.

Looking at the learning outcomes of students at State Middle School 1 Palu, Islamic religious education teachers are looking for solutions to solve problems faced by students, so teachers must find a good and appropriate learning model in applying learning in the classroom. Islamic religious education and character education teachers found the solution by implementing the Jigsaw cooperative learning model. Jigsaw cooperative learning is a very good way for students to learn a concept in the process of increasing deeper, rational, and systematic thinking in problem-solving.

The jigsaw learning model improves student learning achievement; this is evidenced by the completion value. Learning Islamic Religious Education and Character Education achieved by students after implementing the jigsaw learning model is higher than the results of the completion of Islamic Religious Education learning before implementing the jigsaw learning model. From the results of interviews and observations of researchers by the theoretical study put forward by Jhonson and Jhonson that jigsaw cooperative learning creates positive interactions by having various positive influences on student development, including: improving learning outcomes, improving children's memory, achieving high levels of reasoning, encouraging the growth of intrinsic motivation of individual awareness, improving heterogeneous human relationships, improving children's positive attitudes towards school, improving children's positive attitudes towards teachers, increasing children's self-esteem, increasing positive social adjustment behavior, and improving cooperation life skills.

A teacher of Islamic Religious Education and Character Education Teacher, said that:

> The results of student learning so far are like usual with other students; the learning outcomes are

definitely some that are complete, and some are not complete; well, we provide enrichment for those who are complete, while those who are not complete are given remedial.

The explanation above shows that the results of student learning in implementing the jigsaw method on student learning achievement are going well without any obstacles from teachers or students, but not all students have completed their grades well, those who are not complete are given remedial until they are full.

5. Conclusion

The Jigsaw-type cooperative learning model is a method in which students work in small groups of 4-6 people with heterogeneous composition. Each student is responsible for mastering a certain part of the material and teaching it to their group. The steps in this method include: (1) dividing the class into study groups, (2) providing teaching materials in the form of texts divided into sub-materials for group members to study, (3) students study the material, (4) expert groups meet to discuss the material that is their responsibility, (5) expert group members return to their original groups to teach the material, and (6) evaluating student learning outcomes individually. The results of implementing the Jigsaw Type Learning model on student learning achievement are as follows: Teachers as facilitators so that learning activities are centered on students, active learning can build cooperation with group members, have a sense of responsibility, openness in thinking,

courage to express ideas, ideas or arguments in their groups, learn and teach knowledge to their friends, have a short time in mastering the material, so that success and completeness of the material can be achieved.

REFERENCES

Aderibigbe, Semiyu Adejare, Idriz, Mesut, Alzouebi, Khadeegha, AlOthman, Hussain, Hamdi, Wafa Barhoumi, & Companioni, Assad Asil. (2023). Fostering Tolerance and Respect for Diversity through the Fundamentals of Islamic Education. *Religions, 14*(2), 212.

Allen, Deborah E., Donham, Richard S., & Bernhardt, Stephen A. (2011). Problem-based learning. *New Directions for Teaching and Learning, 2011*(128), 21-29. doi:https://doi.org/10.1002/tl.465

Amiruddin, Amiruddin, Nurdin, Nurdin, & Ali, Moh. (2021). Islamic Education Teacher Communication Strategy in Increasing Students' Learning Interest. *International Journal of Contemporary Islamic Education, 3*(1), 41-61.

Arif, Arifuddin M, Nurdin, Nurdin, & Elya, Elya. (2023). Character Education Management at Islamic Grassroot Education: The Integration of Local Social and Wisdom Values. *Al-Tanzim: Jurnal*

Manajemen Pendidikan Islam, 7(2), 435-450.

Aronson, Elliot. (2002). Chapter 10 - Building Empathy, Compassion, and Achievement in the Jigsaw Classroom. In Joshua Aronson (Ed.), *Improving Academic Achievement* (pp. 209-225). San Diego: Academic Press.

Baker, Trish, & Clark, Jill. (2010). Cooperative learning – a double-edged sword: a cooperative learning model for use with diverse student groups. *Intercultural Education, 21*(3), 257-268. doi:10.1080/14675981003760440

Casey, Ashley, & Fernandez-Rio, Javier. (2019). Cooperative Learning and the Affective Domain. *Journal of Physical Education, Recreation & Dance, 90*(3), 12-17. doi:10.1080/07303084.2019.1559671

Corbin, Juliet M., & Strauss, Anselm. (1990). Grounded theory research: Procedures, canons, and evaluative criteria. *Qualitative Sociology, 13*(1), 3-21. doi:10.1007/bf00988593

Dietrich, Julia, Dicke, Anna-Lena, Kracke, Bärbel, & Noack, Peter. (2015). Teacher support and its influence on students' intrinsic value and effort: Dimensional comparison effects across subjects. *Learning and Instruction, 39*, 45-54. doi:https://doi.org/10.1016/j.learninstruc.2015.05.007

Hsiung, Chin-min. (2012). The Effectiveness of Cooperative Learning. *Journal of Engineering Education, 101*(1), 119-137. doi:https://doi.org/10.1002/j.2168-9830.2012.tb00044.x

Hussey, Trevor, & Smith, Patrick. (2003). The Uses of Learning Outcomes. *Teaching in Higher Education, 8*(3), 357-368. doi:10.1080/13562510309399

Manea, Adriana Denisa. (2014). Influences of Religious Education on the Formation Moral Consciousness of Students. *Procedia - Social and Behavioral Sciences, 149*, 518-523. doi:https://doi.org/10.1016/j.sbspro.2014.08.203

Muhtifah, Lailial, Prasojo, Zaenuddin Hudi, Sappe3, Sukman, & Elmansyah, Elmansyah. (2021). The theology of Islamic moderation education in Singkawang, Indonesia: The city of tolerance. *HTS Teologiese Studies/Theological Studies, 77*(4), 1-10.

Nurdin, Nurdin, & Pettalongi, Sagaf Sulaiman. (2022). Interpretive case study to understand online communication in an e-tendering project implementation. *Jurnal Manajemen Komunikasi, 7*(1), 35-54.

Nurdin, Nurdin, Scheepers, Helana, & Stockdale, Rosemary. (2022). A social system for sustainable local e-government. *Journal of Systems and Information Technology, 24*(1), 1-31. doi:10.1108/JSIT-10-2019-0214

Perkins, David V., & Saris, Renee N. (2001). A "Jigsaw Classroom"

Technique for Undergraduate Statistics Courses. *Teaching of Psychology, 28*(2), 111-113. doi:10.1207/S15328023TOP2802_09

Rahmadhani, Layla Rizki, Attamimi, Faisal, & Hanafi, Suhri. (2023). The Role of the Office of Religious Affairs in the Prevention of Underage Marriage in the perspective of Maqashid Syariah *International Journal of Contemporary Islamic Law and Society* 5(2), 45-57.

Rusli, Rusli, Hasyim, Muhammad Syarif, & Nurdin, Nurdin. (2021). A New Islamic Knowledge Production And Fatwa Rulings: How Indonesia's Young Muslim Scholars Interact With Online Sources. *Journal of Indonesian Islam, 14*(2), 499-518.

Rusli, Rusli, & Nurdin, Nurdin. (2021). Understanding Indonesia millennia Ulama online knowledge acquisition and use in daily fatwa making habits. *Education and Information Technologies*. doi:10.1007/s10639-021-10779-7

Säljö, Roger. (1979). Learning about learning. *Higher Education, 8*(4), 443-451. doi:10.1007/BF01680533

Siegel, Christine. (2005). Implementing a Research-Based Model of Cooperative Learning. *The Journal of Educational Research, 98*(6), 339-349. doi:10.3200/JOER.98.6.339-349

Slavin, Robert E. (1980). Cooperative Learning. *Review of Educational Research, 50*(2), 315-342. doi:10.3102/00346543050002315

White *, John. (2004). Should religious education be a compulsory school subject? *British Journal of Religious Education, 26*(2), 151-164. doi:10.1080/0141620042004200018 1929

Yin, Robert K. (2011). *Qualitative Research From Start to Finish*. New York: The Guilford Press.